

# The Rise of #IndonesiaTanpaJIL Youth Movement and the Fall of Liberal Islam on Cyberspace

Akmal\*

University of Indonesia  
Email: malakmalakmal@gmail.com

## Abstract

Since its emergence, the discourse of Liberal Islam has invited much controversy. Several Muslim scholars consider it as nothing more than a continuation of the concepts previously delivered by Nurcholish Madjid or Harun Nasution. Initially discussed in academic forums and laid out in scientific papers, towards the end of the first decade in the 2000s, the discourse of liberal Islam was brought by its supporters to cyberspace, namely through the social media. This strategy has resulted in a rather dramatic change, prompting the emergence of the movement of young Muslims who call themselves #IndonesiaTanpaJIL (ITJ). Although most of its supporters are not scholars, the ITJ actions proved to be effective in discrediting the liberal Islam movement. Through observations in cyberspace, this research seeks to reveal the uniqueness of the ITJ movement and the measures it has taken to confront the liberal Islam. This work will also highlight several developments in the liberal Islam movement itself, resulting in the conclusion that liberal Islam is in fact can be seen as a discourse that has failed to develop in the cyberspace.

**Keywords:** Cyberspace, Liberal Islam, IndonesiaTanpaJIL, Youth, Movement, Indonesia.

## Abstrak

Sejak kemunculannya, wacana Islam Liberal telah mengundang banyak kontroversi. Banyak sarjana Muslim menganggapnya hanya sebatas kelanjutan dari konsep-konsep yang sebelumnya telah diajukan oleh Nurcholish Madjid

---

\* Jl. Margonda Raya, Pondok Cina, Kecamatan Beji, Kota Depok, Jawa Barat 16424.

atau Harun Nasution. Jika awalnya dibahas dalam forum akademik dan dituangkan dalam karya-karya ilmiah, menjelang akhir dekade pertama tahun 2000-an, wacana Islam liberal dibawa oleh para pendukungnya ke dunia maya, yaitu melalui media sosial. Strategi ini telah menghasilkan perubahan yang agak dramatis, mendorong munculnya gerakan pemuda Muslim yang menyebut diri mereka #IndonesiaTanpaJIL (ITJ). Meskipun sebagian besar anggotanya bukanlah cendekiawan, aksi-aksi ITJ terbukti efektif dalam mendiskreditkan gerakan Islam liberal. Melalui pengamatan di dunia maya, penelitian ini berupaya mengungkap keunikan pergerakan ITJ dan langkah-langkah yang diambilnya untuk menghadapi Islam liberal. Karya ini juga akan berupaya menyoroti sejumlah perkembangan dalam pergerakan Islam liberal itu sendiri, sehingga menghasilkan kesimpulan bahwa Islam liberal pada kenyataannya dapat dipandang sebagai sebuah wacana yang telah gagal berkembang di dunia maya.

**Kata Kunci:** Cyberspace, Islam Liberal, IndonesiaTanpaJIL, Pemuda, Pergerakan, Indonesia.

## Introduction

Since its emergence in Indonesia in the early 2000s, liberal Islam has always been a topic of controversy. Several Muslim scholars have put forward criticisms of liberal Islam through various articles in the mass media, scientific papers and books. The Majelis Ulama Indonesia (MUI) has also declared the liberal Islam as a deviation in its fatwa published in 2005.

Liberal Islam caught the public's attention in 2002, mainly after the article "Menyegarkan Kembali Pemahaman Islam" written by Ulil Abshar Abdalla was published in the November 18th issue of Kompas newspaper. However, many scholars are convinced that Ulil's reformation ideas and other such discourses to be nothing more than a continuation of the secularization discourse that was proposed by Nurcholish Madjid in the 1970s, or the "rational Islam" by Harun Nasution. Along with the emergence of the discourse of liberal Islam, a group that openly carried out "liberal interpretations" as their chosen method for understanding Islam, namely, the Jaringan Islam Liberal (JIL), was founded.

Definition has always been a fundamental problem for the liberal Islamic discourse. The name "Islam" which root meaning was "obedient" is difficult to put together with the word "liberal" which

meaning was related to “freedom”. In addition, the usage of other concepts such as “liberal”, “progressive”, or “radical” to the name of Islam would only result in a new artificial concept. Figures like Charles Kurzman and Ali Asghar Fyzee had also been criticized for being uninterested in solving this philosophical problem. Instead, they persuaded people to ignore the debates about the nomenclature and use the term “liberal Islam” only for the sake of practicality. This never-resolved fundamental problem shows its significant impact on the book “Liberal Islam: A Sourcebook”, edited by Charles Kurzman. This book gathers thoughts from several Muslim scholars who are considered liberal; two of them, however, are Moh. Natsir and Yusuf al-Qaradhawi. In reality, both Natsir and Qaradhawi are widely known as opponents of secularism and liberalism.

After the criticisms against Harun Nasution and Nurcholish Madjid was launched, most notably by H.M. Rasjidi in his work, “Koreksi Terhadap Dr. Harun Nasution tentang “Islam Ditinjau dari Berbagai Aspeknya”, and Daud Rasyid in “Pembaharuan Islam dan Orientalisme dalam Sorotan”, several other Muslim scholars also challenged the idea of liberal Islam from various perspectives. Hamid Fahmy Zarkasyi, for example, reviewed the fundamental issues behind secularism in “Misykat: Refleksi Tentang Islam, Westernisasi & Liberalisasi”. Syamsuddin Arif criticized the orientalis and their Muslim followers in “Orientalis & Diabolisme Pemikiran.” Anis Malik Thoaha launched a fundamental critique on the concept of religious pluralism in “Tren Pluralisme Agama.” While Adian Husaini reviewed the history of secularism in the West in his work, “Wajah Peradaban Barat”. Other scholars such as Henri Shalahuddin directly criticized the thoughts of a leading figure of liberal Islam from Egypt, namely Nasr Hamid Abu Zayd, in his work, “Al-Qur’an Dihujat”.

Tiar Anwar Bachtiar, a historian, studied different forms of resistance in response to liberal Islam. He laid out his research findings in his book, “Pertarungan Pemikiran Islam di Indonesia: Kritik-kritik Terhadap Islam Liberal, dari H.M. Rasjidi Sampai INSISTS”. According to Bachtiar, the resistance to liberal Islam has entered a new phase since the birth of the Institute for the Study of Islamic Thought and Civilization (INSISTS). In the past, researchers considered that liberal Islamic has no meaningful opponents and was the best answer to the challenges of modernity for Indonesian Muslims. The presence of INSISTS, founded by Indonesian Muslim intellectuals who studied

in Malaysia under M. Naquib al-Attas, has been keeping liberal Islam in check.

Another significant contribution from INSISTS is initiating the formation of “the INSISTS Network” which consists of organizations that share similar visions, and generally initiated by people who have attended training and lectures organized by INSISTS. Most of them are research institutions much like INSISTS, such as Institut Pemikiran dan Peradaban Islam (InPas) in Surabaya, Institut Pemikiran Islam dan Pembangunan Insan (PIMPIN) in Bandung, or Pusat Studi Peradaban Islam (PSPI) in Solo. Some specialize themselves in specific subjects, such as gender for The Center for Gender Studies (CGS) and family endurance for Aliansi Cinta Keluarga (AILA) Indonesia. Emerged in a totally different situation from other members of the INSISTS networks, #IndonesiaTanpaJIL (ITJ) began as a cyberspace community and then expanded itself to the real space, fronted by youths, not scholars nor researchers. This uniqueness does not fail to make Bachtiar refer ITJ as “the most phenomenal and attractive” member of INSISTS network.

Since 2012, opposition to liberal Islam in cyberspace has been dominated by ITJ and its supporters. The ITJ social media accounts attracted the attention of many, and ITJ branches were formed in various cities. ITJ also contributed by organizing gatherings and seminars of various themes around the discourse on (secularism, liberalism and pluralism).

This study aims to provide a brief overview of how ITJ contributed to the resistance to liberal Islam. Furthermore, the research will also provide an argument to explain why the discourse of liberal Islam in cyberspace can be safely viewed as a failure by comparing it to the ITJ development.

This research will conduct a historical study on the development of the ITJ movement, both in cyberspace and in real space. However, the development of the liberal Islamic discourse emphasized here is as observed in cyberspace. Some of the most important work in this study was done using the Internet Archive Wayback Machine, also by examining a number of social media accounts owned by the JIL exponents.

In this study, it is also important to note the relationship between liberal Islamic discourse and JIL. Both are different entities, but are often identical, since, as will be explained in the following sections, no other organization has openly promoted liberal Islamic ideology

such as JIL. In other words, JIL can be considered as a representation of the ideas of liberal Islamic.

### The ITJ Youth Movement

Most communities were founded with certain goals established from the beginning. However, originally #IndonesiaTanpaJIL was nothing more than just a hashtag on Twitter. The hashtag initially appeared as a response to another hashtag, namely #IndonesiaTanpaFPI, even though ITJ is not affiliated with the Front Pembela Islam (FPI). On February 14, 2012, a group of people demanded the dissolution of FPI in a rally at the Hotel Indonesia Roundabout (Bundaran HI). According to Gatot Prasetyo, the first elected ITJ Prime Coordinator, the February 14th rally was only attended by dozens of people but was covered widely by the media all across the nation. This convinced many people that secular-liberal groups were indeed backed by the mainstream media. Therefore, the #IndonesiaTanpaJIL hashtag appeared as a sign of resistance and solidarity.

On February 21, 2012, an account on Youtube using the name "IndonesiaTanpaJIL" launched a 32-second video. The video shows a young actor, Fauzi Baadilla, who pronounces the phrase "Indonesia Tanpa JIL" and then points one finger to the sky as a symbol of *tawhîd*. According to Indra Yogiswara, who recorded and processed the video himself, the filming was carried out three days earlier (February 18, 2012), very close from JIL's headquarter in the Utan Kayu area, Jakarta. The concept of the video was simply to present Baadilla as a figure known for his rebellious image, nevertheless, he has the courage to defend his own religion. The simplicity of the concept of the video seems to ease the message to be received by the youths in cyberspace.

On March 9, 2012, Forum Umat Islam (FUI) held another rally at the Bundaran HI in response to the previous February 14th rally. In the March 9th rally, titled "Indonesia Damai Tanpa Liberal", a mass wearing white shirts that read #IndonesiaTanpaJIL gathered for the first time. Afterwards, meetings were held and ITJ was officially founded as a community with Gatot Prasetyo as its first Prime Coordinator. February 18, the date when the first ITJ's video was recorded, was chosen as the official date of birth of ITJ.

In May 2012, representatives from ITJ and JIL were invited to speak in the Provocative Proactive radio program by Hard Rock FM. However, JIL's representative never showed up, after previously

confirmed to attend. This prompted some people to assume that JIL was not ready to argue in order to defend its ideology.<sup>1</sup> Meanwhile, in that same year, ITJ supporters also participated in a discussion held at the JIL secretariat in Utan Kayu, Jakarta. One of them shared his experience through his Twitter account.<sup>2</sup>

After appointed its Prime Coordinator, ITJ developed into a broad organization. Supporters in various cities immediately form branches they called “chapters”. Chapters were founded in major cities such as Jakarta, Bandung, Yogyakarta, Surabaya, Padang and so on. On November 11, 2012, for the first time, ITJ held a National Conference (Silaturrahim Nasional, or Silatnas) in Cikole, Lembang, Bandung. Up until 2019, ITJ has held three Silatnas; the last two were held in Puncak area, Bogor.

Using social media, ITJ continues to launch attacks on liberal Islam. This was done using four platforms, namely Twitter, Facebook, Youtube and Instagram. The following is an overview of ITJ’s influence on the four platforms, as per July 10, 2019:

Apart from the cyberspace, ITJ held many gatherings, open talks and seminars with themes around *ghazw al-fikr* and the worldview of Islam. Each chapter has the freedom to work with its own creativity. ITJ Jakarta, for example, initiated a program called *Troops Talk*, which is a talk or discussion that is usually held in coffee shops.<sup>3</sup> ITJ Depok has a “Baca Bareng” program, which is an activity of reading and discussing Islamic-themed books.<sup>4</sup> ITJ Bogor has a “Rame-Rame Diskusi Anti Liberal (Radikal)” program,<sup>5</sup> ITJ Jogja has a *Short Course on Islamic Thought* program,<sup>6</sup> and ITJ Padang made a breakthrough program called *Street Library*.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Salam Online, “JIL Tolak Dialog Terbuka dengan Aktivis Indonesia Tanpa Liberal, Pemred Rolling Stone pun Kecewa”, <https://www.salam-online.com/2012/05/jil-tolak-dialog-terbuka-dengan-akmal-sjafril-pemred-rolling-stone-pun-kecewa.html> (11 July 2019).

<sup>2</sup> Kendy Aditya, “#JIL dan #ITJ dalam Forum #UK68H oleh @fjkreatif”, <https://chirpstory.com/li/30679> (11 July 2019).

<sup>3</sup> ITJ Jakarta, “Troops Talk 17 Agustus 2019”, <https://www.instagram.com/p/B1lfbffHVyX/> (1 September 2019).

<sup>4</sup> ITJ Depok, “Baca Bareng 6 April 2019”, <https://www.instagram.com/p/Bv1iTXUIZsB/> (1 September 2019).

<sup>5</sup> ITJ Bogor, “Kajian Radikal 25 Agustus 2019”, <https://www.instagram.com/p/B1kr9rfn2W6/> (1 September 2019).

<sup>6</sup> ITJ Jogja, “Short Course 7 April 2019”, <https://www.instagram.com/p/Bv3nYyPFp3j/> (1 September 2019).

<sup>7</sup> ITJ Padang, “Street Library 7 July 2019”, <https://www.instagram.com/p/BzlGVpFHOTZ/> (1 September 2019).

In 2014, ITJ also gave birth to a new program called the “Sekolah Pemikiran Islam #IndonesiaTanpaJIL (SPI ITJ)” a non-formal education in the form of a short course that offers studies about Islamic thought. Shortly afterwards, SPI relinquished its structural ties with ITJ. Nevertheless, it has always been connected with ITJ, primarily because most SPI administrators are also ITJ’s activists. SPI had since been active in Jakarta, Bandung and Tangerang.

At the end of 2014, ITJ collaborated with the Youth Islamic Study Club (YISC) al-Azhar to organize an open debate about interfaith marriage. In this event, held at Sofyan Hotel, Tebet, Jakarta, ITJ invited Fahmi Salim from the Majelis Intelektual dan Ulama Muda Indonesia (MIUMI) and Ulil Abshar Abdalla from JIL as the debate participants.<sup>8</sup>

### Liberal Islam in Cyberspace

Unlike the ITJ which continues to grow in cyberspace and the real space, the liberal Islam movement tends to be elitist and its activities are limited to Jakarta. Initially, there were quite a lot of articles, books and studies on liberal Islam, but for a very selected audience, mostly academics. JIL itself, as the main representation of the ideology of liberal Islam, tends to organize its activities in a closed manner. While ITJ had invited an exponent of JIL (namely, Ulil Abshar Abdalla) in a discussion and ITJ’s activists had attended a discussion at the JIL secretariat, JIL had never done the same.

After years of being the subject of conversation among academics, the discourse of liberal Islam was eventually replaced with “Nusantara Islam”, and many argue that both are actually related. Buya Yahya, one of the charismatic figures of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) from Cirebon, for example, argued that he could accept the term Nusantara Islam, but reminded that the people should reject it if the proponents were the ones who previously promoted liberal Islam.<sup>9</sup>

The “migration” of liberal Islam supporters to the Nusantara Islam discourse also prompted further questions. While liberal Islam brings up discourses of modernity, progressivity, reformation etc.,

---

<sup>8</sup> IndonesiaTanpaJIL, “Session 01 - Diskusi ‘Bolehkah Kita Berbeda’ #IndonesiaTanpaJIL & YISC Al Azhar”, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3-4ltcpTS6g>. The second part is available at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HxeK0d03QwI> (11 July 2019).

<sup>9</sup> Al-Bahjah TV, “Bagaimanakah Menyikapi Fenomena Islam Nusantara? - Buya Yahya Menjawab”, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Qf-vHJlIaqEs> (10 July 2019).

Nusantara Islam actually promotes traditionalism. Luthfi Assyaukanie, long been known as one of the main supporters of liberal Islam, when explaining the issue of the Nusantara Islam, is inevitably trapped in this contradiction. In his article entitled “Obsesi Terhadap Islam Tunggal”, Assyaukanie rejected the notion of a singular interpretation of Islam. The term “Islam”, according to Assyaukanie, when followed by other terms such as “liberal”, “radical”, or “Nusantara”, shows a different way of understanding and expression, not a different religion.<sup>10</sup> This explanation is contradictory to the attitude of the Nusantara Islam, which, as seen from its name selection, requires a single interpretation of Islam in the Nusantara, or dominating the interpretations, and rejects others. If Assyaukanie now seems familiar with the discourse of Nusantara Islam which seeks to combine Islam with culture,<sup>11</sup> then it would also contradict his own attitude to tourism in Ternate, Tidore and Lombok, which were not as advanced compared to Bali, by making the religion of the majority of local communities (i.e. Islam) as the scapegoat and not at all considering the local wisdom in the solutions offered.<sup>12</sup> While Nusantara Islam, according to Azyumardi Azra, for example, adopted the Shafi’i Madzhab in its *fiqh*,<sup>13</sup> the supporters of liberal Islam in the past never hesitated to denounce Shafi’i.<sup>14</sup>

In cyberspace, before the widespread use of social media, liberal Islam was represented by the presence of JIL’s official website (<http://islamlib.com>). However, the site had undergone some radical changes, which can be seen in at least three important aspects. *Firstly*, the missing of JIL’s identity as the official owner of the site’s page; both its logo and its description. The column “Tentang JIL” has now been replaced with “Tentang Kami” which does not mention JIL at all. *Secondly*, in the column “Tentang JIL” there was a statement “...we choose one type of interpretation, and thus an adjective for Islam, namely ‘liberal’.”

---

<sup>10</sup> Luthfi Assyaukanie, “Obsesi Islam Tunggal”, <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islamnusantara/obsesi-terhadap-islam-tunggal/> (11 July 2019).

<sup>11</sup> NU Online, “Jika Belum Paham Islam Nusantara Sebaiknya Tabayun”, <http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/97603/jika-belum-paham-islam-nusantara-sebaiknya-tabayun> (11 July 2019).

<sup>12</sup> Luthfi Assyaukanie, “Islam, Turisme dan Toleransi”, <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islam-turisme-dan-toleransi/> (11 July 2019).

<sup>13</sup> NU Online, “Islam Nusantara Menurut Azyumardi Azra, Profesor Kelahiran Sumbar”, <http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/93478/islam-nusantara-menurut-azyumardi-azra-profesor-kelahiran-sumbar> (11 July 2019).

<sup>14</sup> Adian Husaini, *Hegemoni Kristen-Barat dalam Studi Islam di Perguruan Tinggi*, (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 2006), 142-144.



This is in stark contrast to the “Tentang Kami” column which states its attitude that the website “...do not want to judge a thought. We are trying to accommodate all the beliefs that exist in Islam...” The *third* major change is the addition of the “Gagasan” drop-down menu that puts “Islam Nusantara” above “Islam Liberal”. Using the Internet Archive Wayback Machine, it was found that this site change occurred between July 3 and 29, 2015.<sup>15</sup>

The issue of “the missing identity” of liberal Islam in cyberspace can also be observed in the personal website pages and social media profiles of the JIL main figures. For the sake of practicality, six main figures of JIL would be taken as samples. The data obtained are as follows:<sup>16</sup>

Names	Profiles in Cyberspace
Akhmad Sahal	Twitter profile (@sahal_AS): “University of Pennsylvania; Pengurus Cabang Istimewa NU (PCINU) Amerika.”
Guntur Romli	Twitter profile (@gunromli): “Juru Bicara & Caleg DPR RI Partai Solidaritas Indonesia (PSI)   Tim Kampanye Nasional Jokowi-KH Ma’ruf Amin.”  The profile on his personal website ( <a href="http://gunromli.com">http://gunromli.com</a> ) does not mention “liberal Islam” nor JIL.
Luthfi Assyaukanie	Twitter profile (@idetopia): “Homo deus living among sapiens and apes.”  His personal website ( <a href="http://assyaukanie.com">http://assyaukanie.com</a> ), established in 2006, was closed in 2017. Presently, the address is linked to another website, namely Qureta ( <a href="http://qureta.com">http://qureta.com</a> ), where Assyaukanie is the founder and its CEO.
Nong Darol Mahmada	Twitter profile (@nongandah): “Dea & Sasha’s mom, working for freedom and humanity.”  The profile on her personal website ( <a href="http://nongmahmada.blogspot.com">http://nongmahmada.blogspot.com</a> ) still mentions her activities in JIL.

<sup>15</sup> Since the Archive page does not store archives for all dates, only predictions may be made to explain when that change occurred. The archive from July 3, 2015, is available at <https://web.archive.org/web/20150703180731/http://islamlib.com:80/>, while the archive from July 29 is available at <https://web.archive.org/web/20150729061715/http://islamlib.com:80/> (11 July 2019).

<sup>16</sup> All data was taken on July 11, 2019. Information about site activities was obtained by using the Internet Archive Wayback Machine.

Names	Profiles in Cyberspace
Ulil Abshar Abdalla	Twitter profile (@ulil): "Muslim scholar/writer. I grew up in Sunni, Shafi'i, Ash'ari and traditional Muslim family. Now, I move beyond madzhabic boundaries. Big fan of Roger Federer."  His personal website ( <a href="http://ulil.net">http://ulil.net</a> ) was established in 2007 and closed in 2017.
Saidiman Ahmad	Twitter profile (@saidiman): "Libertarian."  The profile on his personal website ( <a href="http://saidiman.net">http://saidiman.net</a> ) does not mention "liberal Islam" nor "JIL".
Zuhairi Misrawi	Twitter profile (@zuhairimisrawi): "Moderate Muslim Society   Nahdlatul Ulama   Middle East Institute Jakarta."

As shown in the table above, Saidiman is the only one who listed "libertarian" in his Twitter account profile. Nong Darol Mahmada's personal website still mentions JIL, while Ulil and Assyaukanie's personal websites have ceased to operate since 2017. Interestingly, the Qureta website, which is closely linked to Assyaukanie, was established in 2015; the same year that JIL's website undergone fundamental changes mentioned. In addition, the column "Tentang Kami" on the JIL's website contains a link to the Qureta Twitter account.<sup>17</sup>

It is also useful to note that no other organizations had openly advocated liberal Islam like JIL. On the other hand, ITJ continues to work with various institutions and other communities to reject liberal Islam, gave birth to Sekolah Pemikiran Islam (SPI)<sup>18</sup> and inspire other similar communities such as Indonesia Tanpa Feminis (ITF).<sup>19</sup>

## Conclusion

Based on the discussion above, we can see a number of developments in different directions on ITJ and the liberal Islam discourse (represented by JIL). *Firstly*, ITJ continues to expand itself

<sup>17</sup> Jaringan Islam Liberal, "Tentang Kami", <http://islamlib.com/tentang/> (1 September 2019).

<sup>18</sup> SPI is an organization that offers a short course on Islamic thought. Its activities can be examined through its social media accounts, including on its Instagram account, namely at <http://www.instagram.com/spi.indonesia> (14 July 2019).

<sup>19</sup> One example is a new movement called "Indonesia Tanpa Feminis", emerged in early 2019 on Instagram. Its account can be found on <https://www.instagram.com/indonesiatanpafeminis/> (14 July 2019).

to various cities, while JIL's activities are still concentrated in the Utan Kayu area, Jakarta. *Secondly*, ITJ's activities are always held openly, while JIL is exactly the opposite. A number of ITJ members have attended discussions held by JIL, and ITJ had also held open debates by inviting speakers from JIL; the same thing has never been done by JIL. *Thirdly*, ITJ is still consistent with issues surrounding secularism, liberalism and pluralism. JIL's exponents, by contrast, no longer promote the issue of modernism, but rather traditionalism, through the discourse of the "Nusantara Islam". *Fourthly*, in accordance the ITJ's open character, ITJ's supporters do not cover up their identities and still use the #IndonesiaTanpaJIL hashtag. Meanwhile, most JIL's exponents are now hiding their involvement in the organization. Even the IslamLib website (<http://islamlib.com>) no longer shows its identity as the official website for JIL. *Fifthly*, ITJ's presence had inspired widespread rejection of liberal Islam and sparked the birth of a number of communities with similar visions and agendas. Meanwhile, the name "liberal Islam" is slowly losing its prestige, and there are no organizations so far that promote liberal Islam as JIL does.

Looking at the above comparisons, we can conclude that ITJ's struggle against the liberal Islam had been fruitful. This does not mean that the discourse has actually ended. In the real space, supporters of liberal Islam still promote their ideology, even though they no longer use "liberal Islam" as their nomenclature. Nevertheless, JIL seems unable to keep up with ITJ, which continues to thrive with all its activities.

In cyberspace, the name "liberal Islam" itself seems to have been completely sunk. Liberal Islam is no longer considered interesting to the public, because its supporters are unable to maintain the discourse in cyberspace. Thus, it can be concluded that liberal Islam had actually failed to develop in cyberspace.[]

## Bibliography

- Abdalla, Ulil Abshar. "Menyegarkan Kembali Pemahaman Islam", in *Jurnal Dirosah Islamiyah* Vol. 1, No. 1, (Jakarta: Khairul Bayaan, 2003).
- Aditya, Kendy, "#JIL dan #ITJ dalam Forum #UK68H oleh @fikreatif", <https://chirpstory.com/li/30679>.
- Al-Bahjah TV, "Bagaimanakah Menyikapi Fenomena Islam Nusantara? - Buaya Yahya Menjawab", <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Qf-vHJIaqEs>.
- Assyaukanie, Luthfi "Islam, Turisme dan Toleransi", <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islam-turisme-dan-toleransi/>

- \_\_\_\_\_, "*Obsesi Islam Tunggal*", <http://islamlib.com/gagasan/islamnusantara/obsesi-terhadap-islam-tunggal/>.
- Bachtiar, Tiar Anwar, *Pertarungan Pemikiran Islam di Indonesia: Kritik-kritik Terhadap Islam Liberal, dari H.M. Rasjidi Sampai INSISTS* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 2017).
- Husaini, Adian & Hidayat, Nuim, *Islam Liberal: Sejarah, Konsepsi, Penyimpangan dan Jawabannya* (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 2002).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Hegemoni Kristen-Barat dalam Studi Islam di Perguruan Tinggi* (Jakarta: Gema Insani Press, 2006).
- IndonesiaTanpaFeminis, <https://www.instagram.com/indonesiatanpafeminis/>.
- IndonesiaTanpaJIL, "*Fauzi Baadilla for #IndonesiaTanpaJIL !*", <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=00rwqgpulu0>.
- IndonesiaTanpaJIL, "*Session 01 - Diskusi 'Bolehkah Kita Berbeda' #IndonesiaTanpaJIL & YISC Al Azhar*", <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3-4ItcpTS6g>.
- IndonesiaTanpaJIL, "*Session 02 - Diskusi 'Bolehkah Kita Berbeda' #IndonesiaTanpaJIL & YISC Al Azhar*", <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HxeK0d03QwI>.
- <https://web.archive.org/web/20150703180731/http://islamlib.com:80/>.
- ITJ Bogor, "*Kajian Radikal 25 Agustus 2019*", <https://www.instagram.com/p/B1kr9rfn2W6/>.
- ITJ Depok, "*Baca Bareng 6 April 2019*", <https://www.instagram.com/p/Bv1iTXUIZsB/>.
- ITJ Jakarta, "*Troops Talk 17 Agustus 2019*", <https://www.instagram.com/p/B1IfbffHVyX/>.
- ITJ Jogja, "*Short Course 7 April 2019*", <https://www.instagram.com/p/Bv3nYyPFp3j/>.
- ITJ Padang, "*Street Library 7 July 2019*", <https://www.instagram.com/p/BzIGVpFHOTZ/>.
- Jaringan Islam Liberal, "*Tentang Kami*", <http://islamlib.com/tentang/>.
- Kurzman, Charles (ed.), *Liberal Islam: A Sourcebook*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).
- Majelis Ulama Indonesia, "*Fatwa Majelis Ulama Indonesia No. 7/MUNAS VII/ MUI/11/2005 Tentang Pluralisme, Liberalisme dan Sekularisme Agama*", <http://mui.or.id/wp-content/uploads/files/fatwa/12.-Pluralisme-Liberalisme-dan-Sekularisme-Agama.pdf>.
- NU Online, "*Islam Nusantara Menurut Azyumardi Azra, Profesor Kelahiran Sumbar*", <http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/93478/islam-nusantara-menurut-azyumardi-azra-profesor-kelahiran-sumbar>.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "*Jika Belum Paham Islam Nusantara Sebaiknya Tabayun*", <http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/97603/jika-belum-paham-islam-nusantara-sebaiknya-tabayun>.
- Salam Online, "*JIL Tolak Dialog Terbuka dengan Aktivis Indonesia Tanpa Liberal, Pemred Rolling Stone pun Kecewa*", <https://www.salam-online.com/2012/05/jil-tolak-dialog-terbuka-dengan-akmal-sjafril-pemred-rolling-stone-pun-kecewa.html>.
- Sekolah Pemikiran Islam, <http://instagram.com/spi.indonesia>.